

From: [REDACTED]
To: [REDACTED]
Subject: RE:
Date: 31 January 2018 09:17:39

If it's ok I will finalise and forward PDF's

[REDACTED]

Sent from my iPhone

On 31 Jan 2018, at 00:15, [REDACTED] > wrote:

Thanks [REDACTED]
Between the report and your email explanations, it is quite clear and we will be in a good position to report to Scottish Government.

Many thanks especially since you have been burning the midnight oil.

[REDACTED]

Sent from my Windows Phone

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 30/01/2018 23:40
To: [REDACTED]
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: RE:

Hi [REDACTED]

I had revised the text and shared with [REDACTED] but an IT glitch stopped me being able to send. Have reviewed again and hope that the statements are now both clear and more accurate. A problem is that to simplicity/clarity for a non-technical reader is, as you know, at the cost of 'accuracy' particularly with respect to interpreting the outputs of fire modelling –by software or by test.

The impact of a fire at RIE on occupants is predicted to be before the cladding ignites in the window open scenario. This is the most vulnerable position in terms of rate to impact and will be influenced by other factors such as wind direction, however the modelling did not address the window shut. The qualitative judgement is that the impact/entry of fire or smoke to an upper room will be longer than where the window is open, to the time of glazing failure, by which time the cladding may have ignited. Whether or not the burning cladding would make a significant difference and to whom is a different question.

This latter was one reason for the initial use of 'significant' because the question to be answered can only be informed by modelling, the judgement is that on the basis of the modelling, qualitative assessment and judgement the contribution of the burning of the cladding to risk of occupants, if any, is not significant for the fire scenarios examined.

I have taken out the ACM references, as from your comments it appears that this is now being used to describe only ACM rainscreen. We cannot describe the RIE panels as simply 'sandwich panels' so I have described as combustible sandwich panels. Their combustibility being the reason for investigation.

Let me know your thoughts, I am comparatively free of meetings tomorrow am

[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 29 January 2018 14:40
To: [REDACTED]
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: RE:

Hi [REDACTED]

I realise that it is based on both modelling and evaluation to evaluate the overall risk, however the fire spread has been assessed using the modelling and if it concludes the cladding will not be a contributory factor affecting the means of escape then that is what we should be highlighting. You have made this clear by stating conditions would be untenable before the cladding could have an impact which gives the assurance required. However, it is a suggested change and it is important that the report is issued as accurately as possible.

Regards

[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 29 January 2018 14:15
To: [REDACTED]
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: Re:

Hi [REDACTED]

Thanks will discuss with [REDACTED] the conclusion is based on both the modelling and an evaluation of the evidence overall.

[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 29 January 2018 14:00
To: [REDACTED]
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: FW:

[REDACTED]

I have suggested a couple of changes to the report. If the computer modelling indicates that the cladding will not increase the risk to occupants then it is important that this is conveyed as a definite statement to Scottish Government and NHS Lothian, particularly in view of the QUEH where the cladding will be replaced purely as a precautionary measure.
If you use the word significantly contribute, it changes the dynamics of the report and could be construed as may affect the safety of occupants in some circumstances. This would impact on the decision making by NHS Lothian.

I will get back to you regarding the QUEH although the important thing for the moment is agreeing on the RIE so that we can report to the ministerial working group on fire safety.

Regards

[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 29 January 2018 11:44
To: [REDACTED]
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: Re:

Hi [REDACTED]

Ammended draft to clarify/rephrase description of the Hunter panels at RIE (pg&).

[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 29 January 2018 09:41
To: [REDACTED]
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: Re:

Hi [REDACTED]

Attached the two draft reports reviewed in the context of comments and following discussion with Iain. Could you please check and if there are no further comments I will send as final report PDF copies for the final record.

[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 25 January 2018 17:46
To: [REDACTED]
Subject: RE:

Thanks [REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 25 January 2018 17:45
To: [REDACTED]
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: Re:

Apologies I discussed points with Iain by phone today. We will close by tomorrow morning or tonight so that you can progress subject to agreement of fine tuning.

[REDACTED]

Sent from my iPhone

On 25 Jan 2018, at 16:32, [REDACTED] wrote:

[REDACTED]

I've tried to get back to you on both your land line and mobile.

I left messages on both that [REDACTED] is working on this just now and we had a brief discussion around lunch time. Whilst I fully understand your time constraints I can't produce a draft until I get more feedback from [REDACTED]

Regards,

[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 25 January 2018 16:12
To: [REDACTED]
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: RE: [REDACTED]

We are under intense time pressure to provide a brief for Scottish Government prior to the Ministerial Group meeting next week. If you are both happy with the content of the reports for both hospitals could you send them on in draft form so that we have an electronic copy. The report could then be fine tuned before final issue.

[REDACTED]
I tried to call you to discuss and hopefully this will explain the reasons for my comments;

I used the old document as I only have a paper copy of the latest version.
The ACM comment being regarded as a rainscreen cladding is perhaps limited to NHS staff as well as Scottish Government cabinet members and officials who are only aware of cladding in relation to recent events and it is imperative that we relay technical information within the introduction in a manner they will follow. Additionally NHS Lothian have informed Scottish Government that they do not have ACM but do have sandwich panels. It is from that point of view that I included the comment.

I take your point re hypothesising about the Grenfell fire, however I thought it would read better as 'they are not the only contributory factor.' Remove - **and they may not be the most significant factor**. I think this removes any implication that other factors may be more significant in the absence of any evidence, whilst still making your point.

Regards

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 23 January 2018 14:36
To: [REDACTED]
Subject: Re: [REDACTED]

I've taken a break from marking and read over your comments on the Qualitative Report. I would point out that you have commented on a document that has now been changed. However, the areas that you comment on remain the same. Where you state "The term ACM is now associated with aluminium rainscreen cladding " you would need to provide me with the source of your information on this. Also where you state "The BRE tests with combustible panels indicated that the ACM was the main reason for fire spread" . The report is in relation to hypothesising about the Grenfell Tower fire and to the best of my knowledge there is no information, certainly in the public domain, appertaining to tests in relation to the Grenfell Tower fire.

Regards,

[REDACTED]

Sent: 23 January 2018 14:26
To: [REDACTED]
Subject: RE: [REDACTED]

Thanks [REDACTED]

We can have a discussion after you talk with Tony. I will give you a call tomorrow.

[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]

Sent: 23 January 2018 14:21

To: [REDACTED]

Cc: [REDACTED]

Subject: Re: [REDACTED]

Hi [REDACTED]

I would need to discuss your suggested 'cover piece' with Tony as some of what you state is not in the final draft as it stands. I have attached what I have put together as an Executive Summary for the QEUH that Tony has but I've not heard back from him as yet.

Regards,

[REDACTED]

Sent: 23 January 2018 14:01

To: [REDACTED]

Cc: [REDACTED]

Subject: [REDACTED]

Hi [REDACTED]

Please find suggested text for a cover piece for both reports.
I have also made a couple of suggestions on the qualitative assessment.

The following make reference to potential fire spread on the RIE cladding which in conjunction with discussions with Tony, HFS advised NHS Lothian and Scottish Government that the cladding would not contribute to fire spread and would not continue to burn unless there was a sustained fuel source.
Attachment – Computer Fire Modelling Point 6 highlighted
Attachment - Re RIE modelling

My understanding was that although there was some information outstanding regarding the RIE, it did not materially affect the report outcome. However if you do require any salient information from NHS Lothian, let me know and I will pursue it.

Please get in touch if you wish to discuss any aspect.

Thanks

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

G

Office Tel :

Direct dial: [REDACTED]

Mobile : [REDACTED]

e mail : [REDACTED]@nhs.net

Web : www.nhs.scot.nhs.uk

This message may contain confidential information. If you are not the intended recipient please inform the sender that you have received the message in error before deleting it. Please do not disclose, copy or distribute information in this e-mail or take any action in relation to its contents. To do so is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. Thank you for your co-operation.

NHSmail is the secure email and directory service available for all NHS staff in England and Scotland. NHSmail is approved for exchanging patient data and other sensitive information with NHSmail and other accredited email services.

For more information and to find out how you can switch, <https://portal.nhs.net/help/joiningnhsmail>

Glasgow Caledonian University is a registered Scottish charity, number SC021474

This message may contain confidential information. If you are not the intended recipient please inform the sender that you have received the message in error before deleting it. Please do not disclose, copy or distribute information in this e-mail or take any action in relation to its contents. To do so is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. Thank you for your co-operation.
NHSmail is the secure email and directory service available for all NHS staff in England and Scotland. NHSmail is approved for exchanging patient data and other sensitive information with NHSmail and other accredited email services.
For more information and to find out how you can switch, <https://portal.nhs.net/help/joiningnhsmail>

Glasgow Caledonian University is a registered Scottish charity, number SC021474

This message may contain confidential information. If you are not the intended recipient please inform the sender that you have received the message in error before deleting it. Please do not disclose, copy or distribute information in this e-mail or take any action in relation to its contents. To do so is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. Thank you for your co-operation.
NHSmail is the secure email and directory service available for all NHS staff in England and Scotland. NHSmail is approved for exchanging patient data and other sensitive information with NHSmail and other accredited email services.
For more information and to find out how you can switch, <https://portal.nhs.net/help/joiningnhsmail>

Glasgow Caledonian University is a registered Scottish charity, number SC021474

This message may contain confidential information. If you are not the intended recipient please inform the sender that you have received the message in error before deleting it. Please do not disclose, copy or distribute information in this e-mail or take any action in relation to its contents. To do so is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. Thank you for your co-operation.
NHSmail is the secure email and directory service available for all NHS staff in England and Scotland. NHSmail is approved for exchanging patient data and other sensitive information with NHSmail and other accredited email services.
For more information and to find out how you can switch, <https://portal.nhs.net/help/joiningnhsmail>

Glasgow Caledonian University is a registered Scottish charity, number SC021474

This message may contain confidential information. If you are not the intended recipient please inform the sender that you have received the message in error before deleting it. Please do not disclose, copy or distribute information in this e-mail or take any action in relation to its contents. To do so is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. Thank you for your co-operation.
NHSmail is the secure email and directory service available for all NHS staff in England and Scotland. NHSmail is approved for exchanging patient data and other sensitive information with NHSmail and other accredited email services.
For more information and to find out how you can switch, <https://portal.nhs.net/help/joiningnhsmail>

Glasgow Caledonian University is a registered Scottish charity, number SC021474

This message may contain confidential information. If you are not the intended recipient please inform the sender that you have received the message in error before deleting it. Please do not disclose, copy or distribute information in this e-mail or take any action in relation to its contents. To do so is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. Thank you for your co-operation.
NHSmail is the secure email and directory service available for all NHS staff in England and Scotland. NHSmail is approved for exchanging patient data and other sensitive information with NHSmail and other accredited email services.
For more information and to find out how you can switch, <https://portal.nhs.net/help/joiningnhsmail>

Glasgow Caledonian University is a registered Scottish charity, number SC021474

This message may contain confidential information. If you are not the intended recipient please inform the sender that you have received the message in error before deleting it. Please do not disclose, copy or distribute information in this e-mail or take any action in relation to its contents. To do so is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. Thank you for your co-operation.
NHSmail is the secure email and directory service available for all NHS staff in England and Scotland. NHSmail is approved for exchanging patient data and other sensitive information with NHSmail and other accredited email services.
For more information and to find out how you can switch, <https://portal.nhs.net/help/joiningnhsmail>

Glasgow Caledonian University is a registered Scottish charity, number SC021474